



**RESEARCH PAPER**

**Baluchistan after 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment: A Critical Analysis**

**<sup>1</sup>Syed Faisal Iqbal \* <sup>2</sup> Dr. Ghulam Mustafa\* Muhammad Arslan<sup>3</sup>**

1. M Phil Political Science, Department of Political Science & International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science & International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan (ghulammustafa@gcuf.edu.pk)
3. M.Phil. Political Science, Department of Political Science & International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan

PAPER INFO	Received	Accepted	Published
	September 16, 2021	December 20, 2021	December 25, 2021

**ABSTRACT**

Federalism partially implemented in Pakistan due to unitary based regimes and their persistent denial to provincial autonomy. Inter wings parity and unitary ruling set-up under the constitution of 1956 and 1962 just raised socio-economic concerns of provinces and made them more conscious about provincial autonomy. The constitution of 1973 was although federal in nature yet it did not address issue of provincial autonomy until the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in 2010. The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment not only addressed issue of provincial autonomy but also favoured Baluchistan through allocation of resources and three newly added fundamental rights. Baluchistan was problematic area since inception of Pakistan and had faced five major military operations as in 1948, 1958, 1963, 1973 and 2005. Political, social and economic miseries of Baluchistan sustained even after the long awaited constitutional development. The situation realised the need to evaluate implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in socio-economic aspects which is key performance indicator of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment. The research also developed theoretical approach as per socio-economic needs of people of Baluchistan. The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment although addressed the concerns of people of Baluchistan yet there is a subtle distinction between to address and resolve the concern and the research abridged the gap.

**Keywords:** Baluchistan, Pakistan, Provincial Autonomy, Socio-economic Challenges, The 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, Unitary Ruling Set-Up

**Introduction**

National aspirations of a federal state are actually amalgamated aspirations of its constituent units. So sufficient autonomy of constituent units is essential to attain goal of national unity. Realising the same ground reality founder of Pakistan assured that provincial autonomy will be fundamental component of political system of Pakistan.

“The theory of Pakistan guarantees that federal units of the national government would have all the autonomy that you will find in the constitution of the United States of America, Canada and Australia. But certain vital powers will remain vested in the central Government such as monetary system, national defence and federal responsibilities” (Ahmad, 1990).

On the eve of partition political horizon of sub-continent was so dominated with two nation theory that unitary based regimes overlooked necessity of provincial autonomy.

The semi-autocratic rulers attempted to change the constitutional nature of Pakistan without understanding its complex nature of federalism. Thrice military regimes and one

civilian government attempted to radically change Pakistan as Ayub and Musharraf followed Atta Turk model, Bhutto focused anti-elitist economic populism whereas Zia attempted to influence society through religious emotions (Lieven, 2012). The thrice models shared the same fate due to lack of national unity and incompetence of leadership. The unitary based regimes although attempted to change constitutional nature of Pakistan yet they compromised provincial autonomy for sake of their parochial interests which caused fear of economical exploitation and feeling of political deprivation across the constituent units. Among of them miseries of people of East Bengal and Baluchistan were beyond the imaginations in term of lack of basic necessities and violation of their fundamental rights.

The unitary based regime even could not assess two major forthcoming challenges in both constituent units and did not adopt appropriate strategy to resolve the issues. First major challenge was to meet the expectations of more populous constituent unit; East Bengal, as on the basis of principle of democracy, people of East Bengal had strong expectations of their dominant role in politics of Pakistan. Unfortunately, majority of eastern wing constrained through inter wing parity which ultimately led to secession of eastern wing.

Another major challenge was to address complex nature of conflict in Baluchistan as the constituent unit was not only conscious about provincial autonomy but it also had multiple concerns.

- Baluchistan contained 45% of Pakistan's total area inhabited by 5% of the population which made it sensitive about even slight influx of population as resources of the province and its geographical importance attracted the people outside the province.
- People of Baluchistan generally developed perception that their expected per capita income based on provincial resources is greater than national average per capita income.
- Historical pride and geographical importance of the province were the motivational factors behind the voice raising of provincial autonomy.
- People of Baluchistan also developed historical fear of extinction and marginalisation which encouraged them for armed resistance against their political deprivation and economic exploitation.

Unitary based regimes neither developed paradigm shift from 'possession of resources' to 'utilisation of resources' nor promoted national sentiments across the country. The central government adopted policy of punitive expeditions rather than reconciliation whereas issue of provincial autonomy left unresolved which caused series of insurgencies in Baluchistan.

**Table 1**  
**Detail Analysis of Insurgencies in Baluchistan**

<b>Insurgency</b>	<b>Duration</b>	<b>Reason</b>
<b>First</b>	Mar 1948 - Sep 1948	Loss of Sovereignty of Khan of Kallat
<b>Second</b>	1958 - 1959	Due to One Unit Policy
<b>Third</b>	1963 - 1969	Deployment of Army in the Province
<b>Fourth</b>	1973 - 1977	Political Disturbance
<b>Fifth</b>	2005 - Onward	Fear of Exploitation

Source: (Tanner, 2019)

Frederic Grare explored three factors responsible for insurgency in Baluchistan; expropriation, marginalisation and dispossession (Muzaffar, et. al. 2021; Mir, 2015).

During latest transition to democracy in 2008 the worst national crisis added to centre-province conflict in form of power shortage, wave of terrorism and economic

deterioration. In such scenario there was no option left other than right and desired constitutional development,, so the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in the constitution of Pakistan was indispensable.

### **Theoretical Framework**

It was hypothesised that effective implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in perspective of utilisation of resources and fundamental right is a source to resolve the centre-province conflict. The hypothesis was the improved version of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment as there was subtle distinction between to address and resolve the concern and the hypothesis abridged the same gap.

Feelings of political deprivation and fear of economical exploitation were axis of centre-Baluchistan relations. The largest land size with least population density, great contrast between reality and expectations in economical perspective and historical pride versus historical fear made the situation of Baluchistan more complex. Colonial rule primarily designed its strategies to utilise the masses in favour of British rule and to achieve the objective tribal chiefs bestowed with honour, prestige and financial rewards. It divided the society into ruling and oppressed class in which feudal lords and tribal chiefs were lower hierarchy of ruling class and end users of devolution of political and economical power. After partition the conflict raised at its extremes even it caused series of insurgencies in Baluchistan. So specific model designed to unlock the conflict in Baluchistan. It was generalised that for any complex ethnic based conflict across the globe socio-economic lock and key model is right solution in which multiple relevant theories and approaches are adjusted and aligned to resolve the issue (Iqbal, 2020). So socio-economic lock and key model designed to resolve the conflict of Baluchistan. (Muzaffar, et. al. 2018)

Socio-economic lock and key model is based on equilibrium of centripetal and centrifugal tendencies. The equilibrium attracts and adjoins heterogeneous elements of society whereas disequilibrium repels and disrupts cohesive bonds which lead to conflict and disintegration. Thus forces of equilibrium and disequilibrium drew lines across the maps either integrating or disintegrating the territories. So division of sub-continent in 1947, debacle of East Pakistan in 1971 and five major military operations in Baluchistan as in 1948, 1958, 1963, 1973 and 2005 were consequences of disequilibrium. Disequilibrium posed serious threat to federalism in Pakistan as the constitutions of 1956, 1962 and 1973 did not address even basic issue of provincial autonomy and encouraged centrifugal tendencies which multiplied already existed controversy in Baluchistan and ultimately led to armed conflict and secession movements. Although the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment addressed the issue of provincial autonomy yet due to its ineffective implementation darkness of political deprivation prevailed throughout and centrifugal tendencies dominated more aggressively. The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment addressed the concerns of people of Baluchistan so it was perceived that it strengthened centre-province relations through encouraging centripetal tendencies.

To reach the equilibrium is not only salvation. Federalism in Pakistan revolved around three circles i.e central circle, provincial circle and sub-provincial circle and every circle had its own centripetal and centrifugal tendencies. Majority ethnic groups are in favor of greater provincial autonomy whereas minority ethnic groups are in favor of strong centre as they considered provincial autonomy as a threat to their peaceful existence.

The majority constraint approach caused a continuous chain of decentralisation as majority ethnic group in a province stimulated by majority constraint approach favored provincial autonomy, the same provincial autonomy was considered as a tool of suppression by minority ethnic groups in the same province.

Baluchistan is victim of same complex conflict model. The province had diverse ethnic composition i.e. Baloch, Brahvi, Pashtuns, Hazara, Lasie and the settlers (Mujahid, 2012). Although the Baloch were the largest ethnic group yet they did not form the majority (Khan, 2009). The Baloch tribes were majority in only four out of thirty districts, namely Kharan, Makran, Sibi and Shagai (Grare, 2013). So it added further complexity in the conflict model as Baloch tribes considered themselves in provincial circles but demographically they were accounted in sub-provincial circle or their provincial circle was at stake. The situation caused political deprivation among the Pashtuns even they demanded that province of Baluchistan should be renamed (Mujahid, 2012). The desire of both ethnicities to shift in bigger circle posed a potential threat to peace of the province.

The entire phenomenon of equilibrium and multidimensional conflict revolves around distribution, utilisation and allocation of resources.

Whether it is matter of equilibrium or complex conflict phenomenon, resource utilisation is central point whether it is matter of distribution, utilisation or occupation of resources.

Scholars such as Collier have established that economic development was crucial in order to reduce the incidence of civil war. Collier related conflict with economical aspects in following ways.

- Lower per capita income raises the conflict as it reduces opportunity cost of rebellion
- Prevalence of unemployment facilitates rebel organisation to recruit
- Natural resources facilitate rebel organisations in term of resources and stimulate them in term of future expectations
- Geographical conditions as mountain terrain also facilitate the rebellion (Collier et al, 2009).

The Collier views reflect scenario of Baluchistan in term of low per capita income, unemployment, abundance of natural resources and geographical conditions. The perception also has developed that Baluchistan has greater resources than national resources which is encouraging factor for Baloch nationalists to struggle beyond the provincial autonomy. As in such scenario secession is profitable option due to raised prize value of capturing the territory rather than of entire state (Humphreys, 2005). So it was the major factor which encouraged the secession movements. According to a July 2012 survey, 37 percent of the Baloch favoured independence, and 12 percent of Baluchistan's Pashtuns favoured that option. However, 67 percent of the total population supported greater provincial autonomy (Grare, 2013). So the survey proved that aggregate demand of population of Baluchistan was beyond the provincial autonomy either greater provincial autonomy or independence.

Perhaps voicing this understanding, Baloch politician and former governor, Mir Ghaus Bizenjo famously claimed that Baluchistan did not need Pakistan but Pakistan needed Baluchistan (Tariq, 2013). Baloch leaders have argued that they never supported foreign development initiatives that extracted resources from Baluchistan for the benefit of Islamabad or Punjab (Tariq, 2013). So economic motives are leading and directing Baluchistan conflict.

Human Need Theory by Abraham Maslow also discussed the hierarchical structure of needs; physiological, safety, affection, self-respect and self-actualisation (Maslow, 1943).

Figure 1: Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs



Source: (Bukhari, 2015)

Maslow believed that to address the needs as per hierarchal structure was an appropriate way to resolve such conflicts.

Despite having huge natural resources Baloch were traditionally nomads (Lotha, 2016). Baluchistan was a poverty stricken province with the lowest per capita income and the poorest literacy rate (World Bank, 2009). The huge gap between present and expected living standard made the Baloch people suspicious about the role of centre which depicted in the statement of Senator Sanaullah Baloch, "Islamabad's offensives to suppress the Baloch struggle for greater autonomy and control on natural resources resulted in killings, displacements, disappearances and unprecedented intimidation" (Baloch, 2007). The statement reflected deterioration of people of Baluchistan in social aspects and serious violations of their fundamental rights. The statement also reflected that in Baluchistan case physiological and safety needs are equally important and solid implementation of Maslow's hierarchical approach to fulfil the needs is not possible.

Nature of conflict precisely described by Nawab Akbar Bugti, "They think that natural resources were national assets, and we think that they were Baloch assets, and whoever wants to use them must do so through us, not by direct possession" (ICG, 2006).

People of Baluchistan had lot of grievances; huge gap between desired and present living standard, lower royalty of natural gas, possible deprivation from potential prosperous outcomes of Gwadar project, poor educational and technical skills, influx of population from outside the province, economic exploitation and lack of irrigation system (Bukhari, 2015).

Another major social grievance described by Sardar AttaUllah Mengal in his famous six points demands in which he highlighted issues of sudden disappearance of people, their brutal killing, internal displacement and rehabilitation (Bukhari, 2015). The situation depicted the severity of the conflict which was a tragic expression of unfulfilled human needs. So it is essential to address their physiological, safety, affection, self respect and self actualisation needs simultaneously even their safety and affection needs were more important.

As Baluchistan has complex conflict model so limited management of diversity was essential. Unitary approach was too capable to monitor the diversity as per need and nature of conflict through theoretical framework so diversity was managed through either to co-opt or coerce the non accommodative groups (Samad, 2007). Neither power sharing

mechanism adopted among the ethnic groups to accommodate diversity nor institutions strengthened on non ethnic based to overcome the diversity. Pakistan could not get rid of majority constraint approach as through inter wing parity majority of Bengal was denied whereas bicameral approach was a retort to hegemony of the Punjab. Provincial autonomy granted through the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment raised voices of renaming and separate province in Baluchistan and reinforced demand of new province of South Punjab.

The consociationalism revolved around four characteristics; grand coalition, mutual veto, proportionality and group autonomy (Lijphart, 1977). So as per consociational approach there was need of political collaboration of leaders of all ethnic groups in Baluchistan, to secure interests of all ethnic groups, proportional representation of ethnic groups in the institutions and liberty for all ethnic groups in their own spheres.

Political structure of Pakistan was based on federalism. Lijphart believed that federalism was the best way to provide territorial autonomy if boundaries of ethnic groups were aligned with the boundaries of constituent units. But if the ethnic groups were dispersed and geographically inter mixed, then autonomy must assume a non-territorial form (Lijphart, 2004). Following the same consociational approach India aligned boundaries of constituent units based on linguistic identity (Adeney, 2002). So federalism in India was a best way to provide territorial autonomy as per constitutional approach. Whereas Pakistan neither aligned boundaries of constituent units on linguistic basis nor adopted non territorial autonomy. Pakistan followed unitary based authoritative approach which ultimately gave birth to majority constraint approach. Secession of eastern wing, insurgencies in Baluchistan, ethnic uprising at provincial level and clash of ethnic groups in the provinces was ripened crop of unitary authoritative approach. So absence of consociational mechanisms had caused much of the conflict in Pakistan so there was need for radical changes along the consociational lines for Pakistani federation to manage ethnic diversity and ensure political stability in Pakistan (Adeney, 2009).

Although it was not possible to implement solid model of consociationalism as it will promote diversity rather than to mitigate it yet it is hard to ignore consociational approach at all. Because coalition of ethnic groups, protection of interests of small ethnic groups, due representation of ethnic groups in political and economical spheres was essential for smooth functioning of political system and to avoid the collapse. So four features of consociationalism are essential to maintain equilibrium in the province as a measuring and monitoring tool whereas its implementation at the electorate level will raise the conflict.

### **Socio-economic Lock & Key Model**

Theoretical approaches are designed and implemented to run political system in more productive way. But in complex and deteriorated scenario it is more appropriate to adjust and align multiple theories with local needs to resolve the issue. The socio-economic lock and key model is same theoretical approach in which multiple theories and approaches are adjusted and aligned to resolve the issue.

To implement Socio-economic lock and key model there is need to understand subtle distinction between address and resolve the issue (Iqbal, 2020). Mostly it is sufficient to address the concern but in rare cases it is not sufficient just to address the concern but there is need to resolve the concern. As the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment although addressed the concern of provincial autonomy but it did not reduce the conflict. Now effective implementation of the 18th amendment in term of socio-economic aspects is one step ahead approach to resolve the conflict. In recent past the Raisman award although addressed the financial concern of East Pakistan but it did not reduce the poverty there which ultimately caused secession of eastern wing. In that case one step ahead approach was not adopted to resolve the concern. The socio-economic lock and key model is generalised as a tool to resolve complex ethnic

based conflict in which multiple relevant theories and approaches adjusted and aligned to resolve the conflict.

To resolve the issue of Baluchistan the socio-economic lock & key model is implemented in following way:

- The equilibrium between centripetal and centrifugal tendencies is central point of the model whereas the complex conflict phenomena revealed that there was need to manage the conflict at thrice level as with the central government, with the other constituent units and within the province.
- To resolve the conflict with centre there is need of appropriate allocation of resources. To manage conflict with other constituent units there is need to manage influx of population and to develop national sentiments. Whereas to resolve conflict within the province there is need of effective provincial and local government set-up.
- In Baluchistan perspective economic theories of conflict could not over look because concern of people of Baluchistan was beyond the equal distribution of resources and expectations of masses were at higher side.
- Historical fear and historical pride with reference to current scenario of Baluchistan were so complex that it was hard to ignore social aspects even there was need to adjust Human Need Theory as safety and affection needs were considered equal to physiological needs rather than to address the needs in hierarchical way.
- Baluchistan has complex diversity model as Baloch ethnicity is just half of the total population of Baluchistan whereas Pashtuns ethnicity is second major ethnic group. Hazara community is although minority ethnic group yet it is more educated and dynamic. Baloch ethnicity is so obsessed with historical aspects that solid implementation of diversity model whether at centre or extremes was not possible. Even it was fear that solid implementation of the diversity models will promote ethnic differences rather than to mitigate. But partial implementation of consociational and centripetal approaches is essential in equilibrium perspective in diverse and complex social set-up of Baluchistan. The four features of consociational approach as a monitoring tool are important components of socio-economic lock & key model.
- Collier views about economic based conflict are important considerations of the model. Baloch ethnicity is very sensitive about economic resources of Baluchistan and is extremely conscious about their fundamental rights. So there is need to address physiological and safety needs simultaneously.

Beauty of socio-economic lock & key model is elasticity as ultimate objective of the model is to resolve the issue. So any theory, approach and innovation may be adjusted and aligned which is supportive to achieve the ultimate objective. In this way socio-economic disturbance in Baluchistan will be address thorough appropriate theoretical framework which is matched with the local needs of people of Baluchistan.

### **The 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment and Baluchistan**

Majority constraint approach melted both demographic and geographic peaks of Pakistan in eastern wing and Baluchistan. Secession of eastern wing realised the need of provincial autonomy which laid the foundation of constitution of 1973, although it matured in term of provincial autonomy through the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in April 2010.

The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment favoured the Baluchistan in multiple aspects.

- The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment abolished concurrent list and number of powers transferred to provinces.
- The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment added three fundamental rights as right of fair trial, right to inform and right of education, so major concerns of people of Baluchistan addressed through it.
- The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment transferred the subjects such as population, planning, electricity and tourism to the provinces. So it made the provinces responsible for raising funds to meet their expenditures.
- The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment ensured that the future revenue share of provincial governments was not less than the stipulated shares under the current NFC award. So the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment secured increased share of Baluchistan in 7<sup>th</sup> NFC award permanently.
- The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment accorded joint and equal rights of centre and province over mineral and natural resources. (Khan, 2017).

So the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment not only granted provincial autonomy but it also caused tremendous increase in share of Baluchistan through better allocation of resources and also addressed the issue of fundamental rights. The response of the provincial leadership in term of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was also encouraging.

The Senator Mir Hasil Khan Bizenjo; leader of National Party, Agha Shahid Bugti; leader of Jamhoori Watan Party, and Israrullah Zehri; leader of Baluchistan National Party(Awami) were prominent Baloch leaders who signed the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment bill whereas Senator Dr.Malik Baloch, President of National party declared it a step towards right direction as it abolished concurrent list and awarded 50% share to provinces in term of revenue generation through oil and gas (Mujahid, 2012). So Baloch leadership realised that the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment addressed the sufficient needs of people of Baluchistan in socio-economic perspective.

But the post 18<sup>th</sup> amendment analysis revealed that the pleasant impact of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was just distant dream. There is persistent socio-economic deterioration and there is prevalence of poverty throughout. Even concern of violation of fundamental rights did not address despite the constitutional cover.

Poverty and unemployment had caused political deprivation which ultimate impact was political instability, poor law and order situation, violence and terrorism. Baluchistan share in GDP in 1973 was 4.5% which decreased to 3.7% in 2000 and situation was aggravating rather than to improve (Tanner, 2019). Baluchistan is a rich province in term of mineral resources, untapped sea food potential and geographical importance (Javaid, 2010). The rising interest of people from other provinces in Gwadar raised threat of influx of population because development of Gwadar port has gained attention of investors across the country (Khan, 2017). Baluchistan just contributed 5% in total population of Pakistan whereas just about half population of Baluchistan was ethnic Baloch (Chishti, 2011). So they feared that even slight influx of population from other provinces will change demography of the province and in such situation they will be minority ethnic group in their own province. The people of Baluchistan were mostly illiterate, partially skilled and due to poverty also had lack of resources. So they believed that infiltrated people will occupy employment and business opportunities and even also legislature. So in case of influx of population from other provinces, provincial autonomy granted through the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment may loose its worth.

Although the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment not implemented in its real essence yet the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment strengthened the centripetal tendencies. It raised hopes to improve living standard of masses and provided constitutional cover to the most concerned fundamental rights of people of Baluchistan.



It is also fact that the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was shift of responsibility from central to provincial government so provincial government was also accountable for poor economic situation and social concerns of people of Baluchistan after the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment.

The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment is vital for strengthened federalism in Pakistan and its roll back or non implementation may be a serious blow to national integrity of Pakistan. Senator Dr. Malik Baloch, the President of the National Party and member of the Constitutional Reforms Committee, reiterated that although complete provincial autonomy was not granted even then it will be disaster if the implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was stopped (Mujahid, 2012).

### **Socio-Economic Challenges in Baluchistan**

Post 18<sup>th</sup> amendment revealed that the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment neither reduced poverty nor resolved concerns of people of Baluchistan in term of violation of fundamental rights. So the huge gap between theory and practice in constitutional aspects turned their political aggression into violent behaviour which gave birth to deteriorated law and order situation, political violence, ethnic conflict and terrorism which ultimately led to political instability. These violent factors not only threatened existing employment opportunities but also ceased potential employment opportunities. It initiated a vicious circle of poverty which caused law and order disturbance, political violence, ethnic conflict, political instability and terrorism and situation deteriorated in every repeat of cycle.

**Table 2**  
**Major Problems of Baluchistan**

<b>Major Problems</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Law and Order	40	20
Political Violence	34	17
Ethnic Conflict	30	15
Terrorism	28	14
Political Instability	22	11
Poverty	18	9.0
Unemployment	11	5.5
Corruption	03	1.5
Other	14	7.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100</b>

Source: (Aman, 2018)

Baluchistan is enriched with natural resources as it had reservoirs of natural gas, coal, gold, copper, silver, platinum, aluminium and uranium (Bukhari, 2015). It also has long coastal line with untapped sea food potential, strategically important sea port and potential transit zone for transportation of energy resources from Iran and Turkmenistan to India. Despite the rich resources lack of health and educational facilities and perception about prevalence of injustice in social and economical aspects as indicated in Table 3 (Aman, 2018) provoked the extremist segments and caused target killing of non-Baloch settlers which worsened the law and order situation in the province. Even there was no impact of mega projects due to dictated development policies of the central government. People of Baluchistan perceive that theses development policies by central government were just tools to exploit the provincial resources.

As indicated in Table 3 (Aman, 2018) 63.5 percent respondents either strongly agreed or agreed that dictated development policies are one of the causes of socio-economic disturbance in Baluchistan. Authenticity of the data also depicted in the latest insurgency

when mega projects of Musharraf caused armed conflict and worsened the situation rather than to improve living standard of masses.

The perception of lack of justice and poor control of provincial government over law enforcement agencies made the constitutional cover worthless for people of Baluchistan.

**Table 3**  
**Causes of socio-economic unrest in Baluchistan**

Statement	Strongly Agree	Agree	Don't Know	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Total
Inadequate access to health facilities	67 (33.5)	90 (45)	18 (9.0)	25(12.5)	0 (0)	200 (100)
Poverty leads to social unrest	69 (34.5)	60 (30)	12 (6)	34 (17)	25 (12.5)	200 (100)
Unemployment leads to social unrest	85 (42.5)	76 (38)	14 (7)	15 (7.5)	10 (5)	200 (100)
Lack of access to education facilities	108 (54)	70 (35)	7 (3.5)	11 (5.5)	4 (2)	200 (100)
Lack of govt. control on LEA	88 (44)	79 (39.5)	21 (10.5)	12 (6)	0 (0)	200 (100)
Lack of quick justice causes unrest	110 (55)	58 (29)	15 (7.5)	17 (8.5)	0 (0)	200 (100)
Target killing of non-Baloch settlers	48 (24)	53 (26.5)	31 (15.5)	47 (23.5)	21(10.5)	200 (100)
Foreign hand creates social unrest	54 (27)	25 (12.5)	30 (15)	59 (29.5)	32 (16)	200 (100)
Unequal distribution of resource	115 (57.5)	58 (29)	12 (6)	15 (7.5)	0 (0)	200 (100)
Dictated development policies	48 (24)	79 (39.5)	27 (13.5)	21 (10.5)	25 (12.5)	200 (100)
Favouritism in civil administration	91 (45.5)	65 (32.5)	21 (10.5)	23 (11.5)	0 (0)	200 (100)

Source: (Aman, 2018)

Miseries of people of Baluchistan as revealed in Table 3 (Aman, 2018) also reflected in leading newspaper Dated March 29, 2015. "Almost 52 percent households in the province were classified as poor, which means that over 50 percent of province's population had no or little access to good education, healthcare and had woefully poor living conditions with no proper arrangements for sanitation and no supply of potable water or electricity. The literacy ratio in Baluchistan was dismally low at 39 percent. The female literacy rate in certain districts was as low as less than one percent. With exception of Quetta, where there were 19 hospitals, all other districts either have poorly-equipped single hospital or in the case of certain districts like Ziarat and Musakhel, there were no hospitals at all even at the district headquarters. Most of the residential houses were far below the standard as a majority of them (65 % in Quetta and 99 % in Turbat) were mud-houses with lack of basic facilities like the supply of water as only two to three per cent households in districts Jaffarabad, Dera Bugti, Kharan and Qilla Saifullah had inside piped-water supply connections. Roads and other communication infrastructures in the province were arguably of inferior quality despite allocation of massive funds for their improvement. The unemployment ratio was also high as almost 33 percent people in Baluchistan were out of any kind of job, despite willing to work, which was far above the national average which stands at 6.2 percent" (Khosa, 2015). Even after three years there was no improvement observed in living standard of people of Baluchistan as per World Bank Report Dated November 11, 2018. "Baluchistan had by far the highest rural poverty rate as more than 62 percent of its rural population lived below the poverty line. Among the 40 poorest districts of the country, districts of Baluchistan had vast majority and the poorest district of the country was also situated in Baluchistan" (World Bank, 2018). Even Dera Bugti; location of Pakistan's largest gas field was ranked last out of ninety-one districts in the Human Development Index (Aslam, 2011). So Dera Bugti was the richest in term of resources but the poorest in term of impact of the resources. The gap between resources and impact of the resources was the real issue of Baluchistan. Despite the Baluchistan was rich in energy resources, its people were deprived from basic facilities as electricity and natural gas. "Demand of electricity in Baluchistan was 1650 MW whereas it was being supplied only 400 MW although it was a rich province in energy reservoirs. Even natural gas supplied only to its few districts. Unfortunately, there was severe shortage of gas during freezing winters, even in Quetta" (Aamir, 2015). Even gas supplied to Ziarat was just due to global pressure to preserve juniper (Khan, 2017). People of Baluchistan also doubted that Baluchistan was

not finding its due share from CPEC. As share of the province was very low as had committed under the corridor's bouquet of projects. Whereas these committed projects also had no measurable progress since last 5 years even two of the largest projects; Quetta Mass Transit and Pat feeder to Quetta water supply were financed by the provincial government (CPEC, 2018).

Tiffany Tanner explored the worst aspects of economic exploitation of Baluchistan, "Baluchistan receives the lowest gas royalty as 0.29 dollars per thousand cubic feet, whereas Punjab and Sindh receive 1.65 and 2.35 dollars respectively. Only 4 out of 28 districts in Baluchistan had availability of the gas. Baluchistan share in GDP in 1973 was 4.5% which decreased to 3.7% in 2000. (Tanner, 2019).

Scenario was not encouraging even in social aspects. Baloch tribes still considered themselves deprived of their fundamental rights as added through the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment.

- Right of fair trial was denied as thousands of Balochs are still missing and Chief Justice of Pakistan had to show his concern regarding this.
- Right of information was also ignored as relatives of missing persons protested on the roads of Islamabad to know about their relatives.
- Right of education was also violated as education is the most neglected area in Baluchistan (Mujahid, 2012).

Carlotta Gall, New York Times correspondent also visited the area in April 2006 and exposed serious human rights violations (Khan, 2017). So the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was entirely ineffective in term of fundamental rights. It made people of Baluchistan suspicious about the role of centre and the establishment. So effective implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in term of fundamental rights is needed to address the grievances of people of Baluchistan and to bring them back into national stream. Although the issues of basic facilities, poverty and unequal distribution of resources were at top priority as in Table 3 (Aman, 2018) yet major concerns of respondents were also lack of justice and role of law enforcement agencies which reflected shocking scenarios.

The provincial government not only had poor coordination with districts in term of development projects as per World Bank report but it also used the resources of the poorest province in non productive ways. As in 2009 out of 65 members of Baluchistan provincial assembly 62 were in ministers rank whereas among of three two had been died and one had bloody feud with chief minister (Lieven, 2012). It reflected that the provincial government was least interested to resolve the miseries of poor people of the province. Even the capability and accountability of the provincial government was also doubted as Fazila Aliani opined that the provincial government was toothless regarding real authority and also predicted that the results of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment would be negligible in Baluchistan due to wrong policies of the establishment (Mujahid, 2012).

Feudalism also shared responsibility of poor economic situation as tribal leadership is hereditary, hierarchical and monarchial even they enjoyed absolute sovereignty over the people of their tribes (Lieven, 2012). So Baloch tribal system is set of multiple autocratic rulers and for them poverty and illiteracy are supportive factors to establish their authority over the people. Dissatisfaction of people from central government and their concerns about the fundamental rights were also in the interest of tribal chiefs and feudal lords. As these factor provoked the masses and they became blind followers of their tribal leaders which ultimately strengthened the tribal chiefs. In such situation the tribal chiefs are more authorised to bargain with the central government to get more political and financial benefits. It blocked the resources at the level of tribal chiefs and political and economic

power could not devolve at grass root level. So it was major hurdle to implement the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in term of effective utilisation of resources at the grass root level.

## **Conclusion**

Federalism in Pakistan could not evolve to mould itself as per needs of federating units due to frequent interruptions. Inter-wing parity and unitary ruling set-up under the constitution of 1956 and 1962 culminated at cessation of eastern wing. The constitution of 1973 was although federal in nature but had same majority constraint designs even issue of provincial autonomy left to be resolved. The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in 2010 resolved the concern of provincial autonomy but till that time Baluchistan had faced five insurgencies, extreme poverty and serious concerns over violations of their fundamental rights. Although the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment directly addressed the socio-economic concerns of people of Baluchistan yet the post 18<sup>th</sup> amendment revealed that the expectations did not materialise. So it was realised that the real need was implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in term of effective utilisation of resources and fundamental rights to materialise its benefits.

Historical analysis of Baluchistan revealed that ethnic pride had more weightage than economic prosperity so there was need to address the physiological and self actualisation needs simultaneously. Even it was more important to address the safety and affection needs.

Economical aspect of conflict in Baluchistan revolved around natural gas. The concern over natural gas was sufficient to understand the nature of conflict of Baluchistan in economic perspective. As we discussed earlier that in term of royalty of natural gas Baluchistan received the lowest royalty compared to other provinces. Baluchistan received the lowest royalty as 0.29 dollars per thousand cubic feet, whereas Punjab and Sindh received royalty of 1.65 and 2.35 dollars respectively. It was quite natural that province to province variation in term of royalty will develop fear of economical exploitation among the people of Baluchistan. In addition to, majority Baloch population is deprived of this precious natural resource as only 4 out of 28 districts have availability of gas. Even gas supplied to Ziarat was just due to global pressure to preserve juniper and to fulfil the need of the people was not real concern. Dera Bugti; location of Pakistan largest gas field was ranked last out of 91 districts in the Human Development Index. Such a huge gap between potential and existing resources multiplied the fear of economical exploitation and also encouraged the secessionists which was major reason of law and order disturbance, terrorism and target killings.

In Baluchistan perspective there was need to activate thrice tiers of state as central, provincial and local even there was also need to add fourth honorary tier i.e tribal leaders. The fourth tier will be engaged in development of policies and decision making but funds should be utilised through local government supervised by provincial government and monitored by central government. Poor coordination of provincial government and districts was major cause of non-productivity of development projects as World Bank reported in 2018 about lack of coordination between provincial government and districts in term of development projects.

Baluchistan contained 45% of Pakistan total area inhabited by less than 5% of total population and half of population was ethnic Baloch. This complex ethnic structure has made the Baloch people more sensitive about influx of population from other provinces. So there was need to secure interests of local population through employment opportunities and social welfare projects. There is need to bound every industrial unit in Baluchistan to initiate one social project for people of Baluchistan.

Baloch had raised serious concerns about violations of fundamental rights. So the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment should be implemented at priority in term of fundamental rights. The grievances of people of Baluchistan should be addressed through locally established Fundamental Rights Commission and each and every case of violation of fundamental rights should be investigated through it.

To monitor the situation through theoretical framework is also important. To resolve the conflict of Baluchistan theoretical frame should be expanded and it should contain economic and social aspects to accommodate the diversity. Collier also concluded that economic development and civil war were inversely proportional.

Human Need Theory by Abraham Maslow addresses the needs through hierarchical structure; physiological, safety, affection, self-respect and self-actualisation. There was need of slight modification in the theory that physiological and safety needs should be simultaneously addressed rather than to prioritise.

Consociational approach needs political collaboration of leaders of all ethnic groups in Baluchistan, to secure interests of even smaller ethnic groups, proportional representation of ethnic groups in institutions and liberty for all ethnic groups in their own spheres. Anyway conflict in Baluchistan is more socio-economic than ethnic so socio-economic concerns must be addressed at priority although spirit of the model to accommodate diversity should not ignored. To resolve the issue of Baluchistan Socio-economic Lock & Key Model is more suitable approach.

The 18<sup>th</sup> amendment favoured Baluchistan as it abolished concurrent list, added three fundamental rights as right of fair trial, right to inform and right of education. It secured share of Baluchistan in NFC award and also accorded joint and equal rights of centre and province over mineral and natural resources. So there was just need for effective implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in term of utilisation of resources and fundamental rights as conflict in Baluchistan is inversely proportional to effective implementation of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment in term of effective utilisation of resources and protection of fundamental rights.

### **Recommendations**

- Primary focus should be over productive utilisation of resources i.e industrialisation and irrigation system. It will expand volume of provincial resources.
- To engage local population in mega projects local people should be educated and trained as per the need of projects. It will not only increase the employment opportunities for local people but also will enhance productivity of the project.
- Capability building education centres should be established to promote local talent and to enhance individual productivity as it will increase employment opportunities for people of Baluchistan inside and outside the province.
- To address concerns of fundamental rights is equally important. Law and order should be maintained through legitimate state system and impression of extrajudicial executions must be reduced through proper investigations. There should be no compromise over the fundamental rights granted through the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment as right of trial, right to inform and right of education. As situation of Baluchistan is highly sensitive in term of these fundamental rights.
- Impression of favouritism should also reduce through strict adherence to merit policy. Prevalence of justice should be assured throughout in every segment of life.
- Employment opportunities should be increased through improvement of industrial infrastructure and economic initiatives.

- The worth of the 18<sup>th</sup> amendment was only due to its impact on lives of ordinary people through its effective implementation. So devolution of economic power and political participation must be ensured at the lowest level. So third tier of the state i.e local government system should be effectively implemented and tribal chiefs should also have treated as honorary part of it. In this way tribal chiefs will be honoured through involvement in decision making process. But funds utilisation must be through provincial and local government.
- Keeping in view the complex situation of Baluchistan Socio-economic Lock & Key Model should be implemented in theoretical framework perspective.

It is point to remember that rising Baluchistan in socio-economic perspective will not only strengthen federalism in Pakistan but it will also politically and economically stabilise South Asian region.

## References

- Aamir, A. (2015, January 30). The Myth of Baluchistan's Provincial Autonomy. *The Nations*.
- Adeney, K. (2002). Constitutional Centering: Nation Formation and Consociational Federalism in India and Pakistan. *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*, 40 (3), 8-33.
- Adeney, K. (2009). The Limitations of Non-consociational Federalism: The Example of Pakistan. *Ethnopolitics*, 8(1), 87-106.
- Ahmad, S. J. (1990). *Federalism in Pakistan: A Constitutional Study*. Karachi: Pakistan Study Centre,
- Aman, J., Akram, M. B., & Saud, M. (2018). Socio-Political Unrest in Pakistan: A Perception of University Students in the Province of Baluchistan, Pakistan. *Matra Pembaruan: Jurnal Inovasi Kebijakan*, 2(2), 97-109.
- Aslam, R. (2011). Greed, Creed, and Governance in Civil Conflicts: A Case Study of Baluchistan. *Contemporary South Asia*, 19(2), 189-203.
- Baloch, S. (2007). The Baluchistan Conflict: Towards a Lasting Peace. *Pakistan Security Research Unit (PSRU)*, Brief Number, 7, 1-9.
- Bukhari, H. S. S., Roofi, Y., & Bukhari, S. A. (2015). Resolving Baluchistan Conflict: A Human Needs Approach. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 35(1), 377-389.
- Chishti, N. A. (2011). Impact of Eighteenth Amendment on Resolving the Issue of Baluchistan. In MH Nuri, & MH Khan, *Eighteenth Amendment Revisited*. Islamabad: Islamabad Policy Research Institute,
- Collier, P., Hoeffler, A., & Rohner, D. (2009). Beyond Greed and Grievance: Feasibility and Civil War. *Oxford Economic Papers*, 61(1), 1-27.
- CPEC and Baluchistan. (2018, December 12). *Dawn*.
- Grare, F. (2013). Baluchistan. The State versus The Nation. *South Asia*,
- Humphreys, M. (2005). Natural Resources, Conflict, and Conflict Resolution: Uncovering the Mechanisms. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 49(4), 508-537.
- International Crisis Group. (2006). Pakistan: The Worsening Conflict in Baluchistan. *Asia Report*, (119).
- Iqbal, S. F. (2020). *Centre Province Relations after the 18th Amendment: A Case Study of Baluchistan* (Master's thesis). G.C. University Faisalabad.
- Javaid, U. (2010). Concerns of Baluchistan: Effects and Implications on Federation of Pakistan. *Journal of Political Studies*, 17(2), 113-125.
- Khan, A. (2009). Renewed Ethnonationalist Insurgency in Baluchistan, Pakistan: the Militarized State and Continuing Economic Deprivation. *Asian Survey*, 49(6), 1071-1091.
- Khan, H. (2017). *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan* Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Khosa, S. (2015, March 29). Baluchistan: Misery and Poor Governance. *Dawn*.
- Lieven, A. (2012). *Pakistan: A Hard Country*. London: Public Affairs.

- Lijphart, A. (1977). *Democracy in Plural Societies: A Comparative Exploration*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Lijphart, A. (2004). Constitutional Design for Divided Societies. *Journal of Democracy*, 15(2), 96-109.
- Lotha, G. (2016). Baloch. In *Encyclopaedia Britannica*.
- Maslow, A. H. (1943). A Theory of Human Motivation. *Psychological Review*, 50 (4), 370-396.
- Mir, F., & Bazai, A. (2015). Challenges to National Integration: A Case Study of Baluchistan. *Journal of Contemporary Studies*, 4(1), 81-94.
- Mujahid, A. B. (2012). Baluchistan and Eighteenth Amendment. *Pakistan Vision*, 13(2), 145-159.
- Muzaffar, M. Karamat, S. & Saeed, K. (2018). Balochistan Insurgency: Causes and Prospects, *Orient Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(1), 112-128
- Muzaffar, M. Khan, I. & Yaseen, Z. (2021). Issues and Conflicts in Balochistan: Implications for Pakistan, *Journal of Political Studies*, 28 (1), 43-54
- Samad, Y. (2007). Pakistan: from Minority Rights to Majoritarianism. *Faultlines of Nationhood: Cross Border Talks*, 63-138.
- Tanner, T. (2019). *Explaining the Resilience of the Baluchistan Insurgency* (Doctoral dissertation). Honors College. 533.
- Tariq, M. (2013). Conflict in Baluchistan. *Strategic Studies*, 33(3/4), 23-40.
- World Bank. (2009, November 8). Poverty Rising in Baluchistan, says World Bank. *Dawn*.
- World Bank. (2018, November 11). 80pc of Pakistan's Poor live in Rural areas, says World Bank Report. *Dawn*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1444874>